بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

Series of Questions Addressed to Eminent Scholar Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah Ameer of Hizb ut Tahrir through his Facebook Fighi Page

Answer to Question

Casting Doubt in Lailat ul-Qadr (the Night of Decree)

To: Nabil Bala'ti

(Translated)

Question:

Assalam Alaikum Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh

May Allah support you. Someone says that Lailat ul-Qadr is the night of the revelation of the Qur'an, and it has passed and this alleged Lailat ul-Qadr does not exist, according to him. This is the text of the article: ("As for Lailat ul-Qadr, it has come in history once and it is not repeated, it gets its qadar, i.e., its unique status because the Qur'an was revealed in it. Allah (swt) said: ﴿

| "Indeed, We sent it [i.e., the Qur'ān] down during the Night of Decree" [Al-Qadr: 1] As for other nights that are mistakenly calculated as Lailat ul-Qadr, there is no weight to them, because no Qur'an was revealed in them so that they derive from this revelation a special qadar and status.

If someone who rejects this said: In fact, we commemorate Lailat ul Qadr since it is not repeated. So we say to him: In order for us to celebrate Lailat ul-Qadr or revive it as required by the alleged Hadith, whether we believe that it is Lailat ul-Qadr, or that it is a remembrance of Lailat ul-Qadr, it must have one known appointed time like all other acts of worship such as fasting, pilgrimage and prayer, because the Wise Legislator, when He imposed worship or its enactment, He has set for each of them a fixed known time in which there is no room for (for guessing). As for this alleged Lailat ul-Qadr, many Hadiths have been mentioned regarding determining its time, which make it a mystery among the mysteries...etc.)

ريا أيها الناس! إنها كانت أُبيئت لي ليلة Then he mentions the Hadith of Muslim and challenged it: «يا أيها الناس! إنها كانت أُبيئت لي ليلة O people, Lailat-ul-Qadr was made manifest to me and I came out to inform you about it that two persons came contending with each other and there was a devil along with them and I forgot it". and defames it!!

Then he concludes his saying with the following: (In summary, reviving the alleged Lailat ul-Qadr, which the Messenger himself did not know a specific time for it, nor a specific shore on which the ship of assignment anchors, and considering that whoever performed it out of belief and anticipation of reward will be forgiven for his previous sins, is a subversive and destructive idea. It spreads among common Muslims nothing except hallucinations, foolishness, and concessions in the Deen." End of his article.

Please advise us. May Allah send His Baraka upon you.

Answer:

Wa Alaikum Assalam Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh,

I saw what you quoted in your question about that person who attacks Lailat ul-Qadr and said that it is a night that has passed and finished... etc. The following is for you:

First: Regarding the method of approach:

1- It is clear from the text that you quoted that its author is not disciplined by any scientific rules or legal Shariah knowledge, but rather he errs randomly and rejects the many sahih (correct) and hasan (good) Hadiths without a compelling reason except what is

dictated by the illusions of his perception which he made it in his mind a fact, upon which he builds and rejects what is proven from the Messenger of Allah (saw).

- 2- It is also clear from this quoted article that it is an attempt to undermine the purified Sunnah of the Prophet and to cast doubt on Muslims in the narrated Hadiths of the Prophet (saw) with the claim of referring to the Noble Qur'an. This is a common approach, and it is the approach of people working to destroy Islam and fight it by fighting the purified Prophet's Sunnah. It is the clarification of the Noble Qur'an, the clarification of its entirety, the specification of its generality, the restriction of its absolute, the attachment of a branch to its origin, etc. Defaming the purified Prophet's Sunnah and casting doubt on the approved Hadith books is a form of defamation of the Qur'an and defamation of Islam. The call to limit reliance on the Noble Qur'an alone is an invitation that on the outside it carries mercy, and its inner side is torment.
- 3- It is also clear from the transmitted text that its author cast doubt on the well-known Islamic legal matters among Muslims from the time of the Prophet (saw) and his noble companions to this day. This is also a well-known approach that was adopted by the orientalists, the Western disbelievers, who delved into questioning every Muslim matter that is self-evident among Muslims, then they were followed on this path by their lackeys among the children of Muslims. They casted doubt on the system of government in Islam, jihad, and the belief in the judiciary and Al-Qada Wal Qadar... etc., in order to weaken the confidence of Muslims in their Deen and try to divert them from it and divert them from returning to it after they overthrew its state and removed its rulings from application in the lives of Muslims.
- **4-** Accordingly, his article on Lailat ul-Qadr is not serious scientific research or a considered Shariah opinion and lithad. Rather, it is a kind of misrepresentation that is forbidden, tampering with the legal texts, and mocking the Hadiths of the Prophet. Therefore, it is not worth responding to it because it is devoid of the minimum conditions of honest scientific research. If you had not sent us a question about it, we would not have been exposed to it.

Second: Evidence from the Qur'an on Lailat ul-Qadr:

The writer deceives the reader that he takes and relies on what came in the noble Qur'an, and only rejects the Hadiths mentioned regarding Lailat ul-Qadr, as he says: ("As for Lailat ul-Qadr, it has come in history once and it is not repeated, it gets its qadar, i.e., its unique status because the Qur'an was revealed in it. Allah (swt) said: ﴿إِنَّا الْفَدْنِ اللَّهُ الْفَدْنِ الْقَدْنِ اللَّهُ الْفَدْنِ اللَّهُ الْفَدْنِ اللَّهُ اللهُ الل

He mentions the noble verse: ﴿ اِللَّا الْكَانُاهُ فِي لَيْلَةٍ الْقَدْرِ﴾ "Indeed, We sent it [i.e., the Qur'ān] down during the Night of Decree" [Al-Qadr: 1]. And he interprets it according to his whims in a way that serves his opinion, but he does not mention the rest of the Qur'anic texts that indicate a disagreement with his opinion. The text about Lailat ul-Qadr was mentioned in two places in the noble Qur'an, and it is understood from the two places that Lailat ul-Qadr is a renewed and recurring night:

[Tafsir al-Nasafi (4/44, numbered by al-Shamilah automatically):

"Indeed, We sent it [i.e., the Qur'ān] down during the Night of Decree". The Qur'an is glorified since its revelation to Him alone was specified in exclusion of others. Its pronoun came without its apparent name as a dispension, to give it attention and raise the weight of the time in which it was sent down in. It was narrated that the whole of the Qur'an was sent down on Lailat ul-Qadr from Al-Lawh Al Mahfooz (Preserved Tablet) to the heavens, then Jibreel (as) was sending it down to the Messenger of Allah (saw) for twenty-three years. The meaning of Lailat ul-Qadr is the night of decreeing and deciding matters.

Perhaps the reason for concealing it is that whoever is seeking it is to revive it in the many nights in hope of attaining it. This is like concealing the middle prayer, His (swt) Greatest Name, and the Hour of Answer (of duaa) on Friday. It is stated in the Hadith: «من "Whoever realizes it should say: Allahumma innaka 'afuwwun, tuhibbul-'afwa, fa'fu 'anni (O Allah, You are Most Forgiving, and You love forgiveness; so forgive me". ﴿وَمَا أَدُرَاكُ مَا لَيْلَةُ الْقَدرِ﴾ "And what can make you know what is the Night of Decree?" That is, your knowledge did not reach the goal of its virtue…] End of the narration from Tafsir al-Nasafi.

And the surah contains more than one matter that clarifies that Lailat ul- Qadr is a recurring night that coincides with that blessed night in which the Qur'an was revealed, and it is enough is His (swt) saying: ﴿ثَانُ الْمُلْاِئِكَةُ وَالرُّوحُ فِيهَا بِإِلْنِ رَبِهِمْ مِنْ كُلِّ أَمْرٍ "The angels and the Spirit [i.e., Gabriel] descend therein by permission of their Lord for every matter." The angels descend on this night, and Jibreel (as) is with them, and the Qur'an uses the present tense in a verbal sentence ﴿ثَنَّ الْمُلَائِكَةُ ﴿The angels descend" To denote continuity and renewal, the past tense denoting the expiry was not used. This clearly means that Lailat ul Qadr is a recurring night and that the angels descend every year on that night with Jibreel (as).

2- Allah's saying in the first verse of Surat Ad-Dukhan:

Indeed, We sent it down during a" ﴿إِنَّا أَنْزَلْنَاهُ فِي لَيْلَةٍ مُبَارَكَةٍ إِنَّا كُنَّا مُنْذِرِينَ * فِيهَا يُفْرَقُ كُلُّ أَمْر حَكِيمٍ﴾ blessed night. Indeed, We were to warn [mankind] * Therein [i.e., on that night] is made distinct every precise matter" [Ad-Dukhan: 3-4]. It is stated in Al-Nasafi (3/302): [...and Lailat ul-Qadr in most of the sayings is in the month of Ramadan. Then they said: He sent it down as a whole from Al-Lawh Al Mahfooz (Preserved Tablet) to the Heavens, then Jibreel (as) brought it down at the time when the need occurred for His Prophet Muhammad (saw). And it was said: The beginning of its descent was on Lailat ul-Qadr. And the Baraka is the abundance of good because of the good and blessing that is sent down in it and the supplication is answered. And if there was nothing in it except for the revelation of the Qur'an alone, it would suffice as a blessing. ﴿إِنَّا كُنَّا مُنذِرِينَ * فِيهَا يُفْرَقُ كُلُّ أَمْرِ \text{We were to warn} ﴿إِنَّا كُنَّا مُنذِرِينَ * فِيهَا يُفْرَقُ كُلُّ أَمْرٍ \text{Alone, it would suffice as a blessing.} [mankind] * Therein [i.e., on that night] is made distinct every precise matter" [Ad-Dukhan: 3-4]. They are two resuming sentences wrapped around, explaining the answer to the oath as if it was said: We revealed it because it is our business to warn and warn against punishment, and we revealed it on this night in particular, because the revelation of the Qur'an is one of the wise matters, and this night distincts every wise matter. And the meaning of "yufragu" that details and writes every matter of the servants' livelihood, their Ajal (time span), and all their affairs from this night until Lailat ul-Qadr that comes in the next year. The "Hakeem" with wisdom, that is, the object of what wisdom requires, it is from the metaphorical attribution, because the "Hakeem" is the description of the owner of the matter in reality and the description of the matter Metaphorically...] **End**

It is also clear from these verses that Lailat ul-Qadr in which the Qur'an was revealed is a recurring night, and it suffices the saying of Allah (swt): ﴿فِيهَا يُفْرَقُ كُلُّ أَمْرٍ حَكِيمٍ "Therein [i.e., on that night] is made distinct every precise matter" which indicates without a doubt that this night in which every wise matter is differentiated repeatedly because

the Qur'an uses the word "feeha yufraqu" which is a present tense verb that indicates continuity and renewal.

3- Thus, it is clearly understood from the Qur'an that Lailat ul-Qadr is a blessed night in which the noble Qur'an was revealed, and it is one of the nights of the blessed month of Ramadan; in it the angels and the Spirit descend by permission of their Lord in every matter, as every wise matter is differentiated as an order from Allah. This night has great bounty, as the virtue of good deeds in it exceeds the virtue of the work of a thousand months. Thus, it appears that the noble Qur'an declares that Lailat ul-Qadr is a recurring night, and that the honorable Prophetic Hadiths regarding Lailat ul-Qadr came confirming and affirming what came in the noble Qur'an as we explained below. If the author of the research quoted at the top acknowledges the noble Qur'an and what came in it, so there is no room for him to refute those noble Hadiths

Third: The Sunnah's evidences of Lailat ul-Qadr

- 1- There are many Hadiths in the Sunnah of the Prophet, which speak of the fact that Lailat ul-Qadr is a recurring and renewed, and we mention two of them that are sufficient to indicate what is required:
- a- Al-Bukhari narrated in his Sahih on authority of Abu Huraira (ra) from the Prophet (saw): «مَنْ قَامَ لَيْلَةُ الْقَدْرِ إِيمَاتاً وَاحْتِسَاباً غُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ صَامَ رَمَضَانَ إِيمَاتاً وَاحْتِسَاباً غُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ صَامَ رَمَضَانَ إِيمَاتاً وَاحْتِسَاباً غُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ صَامَ رَمَضَانَ إِيمَاتاً وَاحْتِسَاباً غُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ صَامَ رَمَضَانَ إِيمَاتاً وَاحْتِسَاباً غُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ صَامَ رَمَضَانَ إِيمَاتاً وَاحْتِسَاباً غُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ صَامَ رَمَضَانَ إِيمَاتاً وَاحْتِسَاباً غُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ثَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَنْ نَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَلِيمَاناً عُفِرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَنْ يَقُمْ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَنْ يَقُمْ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ يَقُمْ لَلْهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَعْمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَا إِلَيْهُ الْمَالْمُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَنْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَا لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَا لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَلْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبُهِ مِلْ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَا لَعْمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَا لَعُلَمْ مِنْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبُهِ وَمَلْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبِهِ وَمَا لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبُهِ وَمَلْ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبُهِ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبُهِ وَمَا لَهُ مُعْتَلِهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ تَنْبُهِ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَنْ تَنْبُهِ مَا تَقَدَّمُ مِنْ تَنْبُهِ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَعْفَرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَعْفَرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَعْفَرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَعْفَرَ لَهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مَا تَعْمَلُهُ مَا تَعْفَرَ لَهُ مَا تَعْفَرَ لَهُ مَا
- b- Tirmidhi narrated in his Sunan from Aishah (ra) that she said: "I said: 'O Messenger of Allah, what is your view if I know when the Night of Al-Qadr is, then what should I say in it?" He said: 'Say: «قُولِي اللَّهُمُّ إِنَّكُ عُفُو كُرِيمٌ تُحِبُ الْعَفُو فَاعَفُ عَنِي» "O Allah, indeed You are Pardoning, [Generous,] You love pardon, so pardon me (Allāhumma innaka 'Afuwwun [Karīmun], tuḥibbul-'afwa fa'fu 'annī)." Abu Isa said this hadith is Hasan Sahih, and in another narration of the Hadith, by Ibn Majah and others and from Aishah that she said: "O Messenger of Allah, what do you think I should say in my supplication, if I come upon Laylatul-Qadr?" He said: "Say: "خَوْبُ الْعُفُو فَاعَفُ عَنِي اللَّهُمُّ إِنِّكُ عَفُو تُحبُ الْعَفُو فَاعَفُ عَنِي 'Allahumma innaka 'afuwwun tuhibbul-'afwa, fa'fu 'anni (O Allah, You are Forgiving and love forgiveness, so forgive me) This Hadith is also completely consistent with what is in the noble Qur'an about Lailat ul-Qadr, and it is clear from it that Lailat ul-Qadr is repeated and renewed. This is how the Hadith is understood correctly, as we are commanded to follow the Sunnah as we are commanded to follow the Book. ﴿ وَمَا آتَاكُمُ الرَّسُولُ فَخُلُوهُ وَمَا نَهَاكُمُ عَنُهُ فَاتَنَهُوا﴾ "And whatever the Messenger has given you take; and what he has forbidden you refrain from" [Al-Hashr: 7].
- 2- The refutation of the hadith is not based on the whim of the person, or because he is ignorant of understanding its meaning, or due to a spiteful need in himself,etc. Rather, the Hadith is refuted in the manner that came in the sciences of Hadith and the principles of jurisprudence, and it is explained in its section for everyone who has a heart or listens while he is present (in mind):

The Hadith is rejected in narration and meaning. The following stated in the book, The Islamic Personality Volume I on this subject:

[Conditions for Accepting the Individuals Report

Khabar Al-Aahaad is accepted if it meets the acceptance conditions of the narration (riwaayah) and the knowledge about its content (diraayah). As for the acceptance conditions of the narration; they are that, the narrator of the Hadeeth must be: Muslim, mature, sane, just, truthful, accurate in what he heard and remembering the Hadeeth since he carried (heard) it until he narrated it. The scholars of the usoul and the scholars of the Hadeeth terminology had clarified the conditions of the narration in details. And the biography of the men of the Hadeeth and their narrations had shown every narrator and what he fulfills of these qualities in details.

As for the knowledge (diraayah) conditions for accepting khabar Al-Aahaad, they are that it does not contradict what is stronger (more authentic). In conclusion, if the individuals report contradicts an ayah of the Qur'aan or a mutawaatir or a mashhour Hadeeth or an illah explicitly dictated by the Qur'aan, Mutawaatir or Mashhour; the Hadeeth will not be accepted as per diraayah (after knowledge), and if it does not contradict any of those; it will be accepted. And if the Hadeeth contradicts the qyas; the Hadeeth will be accepted and the qyas will be rejected] **End.**

If a person is presented with a Hadith that he does not know whether to take it or reject it, then let him ask someone who has knowledge of it.

The Messenger (saw) said: «أَلَا سَأَلُوا إِذْ لَمْ يَعْلَمُوا فَإِنَّمَا شُفَاءُ الْعِيَ السُّوَالُ» "Could they not ask when they did not know? The cure for ignorance is inquiry" [Extracted by Abu Dawoud]

This is how the sane person who fears Allah and His Messenger does; he does not defame the Hadith or mock it; otherwise, it would be a great sin for him. Now, we will discuss a Hadith as an example of that, which the author of the article challenged or ridiculed, and the author of the article assumed this poor position:

The author of the article mocks the Hadith narrated by Muslim in his Sahih about the time of Lailat ul-Qadr and that the Prophet (saw) was shown Lailat ul-Qadr and then forgot it. He said: [How does the Messenger (saw) forget it? When Allah (swt) says: ﴿

"We will make you recite, [O Muḥammad], and you will not forget * Except what Allah should will" [Al-A'la: 6-7], which means that we will make you recite it and never forget it...] This person does not realize what he is saying! The verse is about the Noble Qur'an, for Allah (swt) recites the Noble Qur'an to the Messenger (saw) and He memorizes it and never forgets it. In its interpretation it states:

A-Interpretation of Al-Qurtubi (18/20)

Allah's (swt) saying: ﴿﴿ اللهُ اللهُ اللهُ **We will make you recite** meaning the Qur'an, O Muhammad, so we will teach you it. ﴿فَلَا تَتُسْنَى﴾ "And you will not forget*" meaning memorize it. [Narrated by Ibn Wahb on the authority of Malik].

And this is good news from Allah (swt); He (swt) gave the Prophet (saw) good news; He (swt) gave him a clear sign, which is that Jibreel (as) would read to him (saw) the revelation. He (saw) is illiterate and does not write or read, so he (saw) will memorize it and does not forget it.)

B-Interpretation of At-Tabari (370 /24)

And His saying: ﴿ اللّهُ مَا شَاءَ اللّهُ * "We will make you recite, [O Muḥammad], and you will not forget * Except what Allah should will" [Al-A'la: 6-7]. Allah (swt) says: We will recite this Qur'an to you, O Muhammad, so you will not forget it, except what Allah should will.

Then the people of interpretation differed about the meaning of His (swt) saying: ﴿

"We will make you recite, [O Muḥammad], and you will not forget *

Except what Allah should will" [Al-A'la: 6-7], and some of them said: This is a message from Allah (swt) to His Prophet (saw) that He teaches him this Qur'an and preserves it for

him, and He (swt) forbade him (saw) to hasten to recite it, as He (swt) said: ﴿ لا تُحَرِّكُ بِهِ لِسَاتُكَ and He (swt) forbade him (saw) to hasten to recite it, as He (swt) said: ﴿ لا تُحَرِّكُ بِهِ لِسَاتُكَ and [to make possible] its recitation." [Al-Qiyamah: 16-17].

Thus, in other interpretations, the aforementioned verse is about the Noble Qur'an, and otherwise, Allah (swt) may make His Messenger (saw) forget a matter for a wisdom He (swt) knows. The text of the Hadith as in Muslim on the authority of Abu Saeed Al -Khudari, may Allah be pleased with him, said: (The Messenger of Allah (saw) observed i'tikaf in the middle ten days of Ramadan to seek Lailat-ul-Qadr before it was made manifest to him. When (these nights) were over, he commanded to strike the tent. Then it was made manifest to him that (Lailat-ul-Qadr) was in the last ten nights (of Ramadan), and commanded to pitch the tent (again). He then came to the people and said: ﴿يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ إِنَّهَا كَاتَتْ أَبِينَتْ لِي لَيْلَة الْقَدْرِ وَإِنِّي خَرَجْتُ لأُخْبِرَكُمْ بِهَا فَجَاءَ رَجُلَان يَحْتَقَان مَعَهُمَا الشَّيْطَانُ فَنُسْيَتُهَا فَالْتَمسُوهَا في الْعَشْر الْأَوَاخِر مِنْ رَمَضَانَ الْتَمسُوهَا في التَّاسِعَة O people, Lailat-ul-Qadr was made manifest to me and I came out to وَالْسَابِعَةِ وَالْخَامِسَةِ» inform you about it that two persons came contending with each other and there was a devil along with them and I forgot it. So, seek it in the last ten nights of Ramadan. Seek it on the ninth, on the seventh and on the fifth". I (one of the narrators) said: Abu Sa'id, you know more than us about numbers. He said: Yes, indeed we have better right than you. I said: What is this ninth, seventh, and fifth? He said: When twenty-one (nights are over) and the twenty-second begins, it is the ninth, and when twenty-three (nights) are over, that which follows (the last night) is the seventh, and when twenty-five nights are over, what follows it is fifth. Ibn Khallad said: Instead of the word Yahliqan (contending), he said Yakhtasiman, (they are disputing). This Hadith is narrated by Bukhari, in brief, on the authority of 'Ubada Bin As-Samit that the Messenger of Allah (saw) came out to inform (the «إِنِّي خَرَجْتُ Muslims) of Lailat ul-Qadr. Two men from the Muslims quarrelled, He (saw) said: ﴿إِنِّي خَرَجْتُ The" لِأَخْبِرَكُمْ بِلَيْلَةِ القَدْرِ، وَإِنَّهُ تَلَاحَى فَلَانٌ وَفَلَانٌ، فَرُفِعَتْ، وَعَسَى أَنْ يَكُونَ خَيْراً لَكُمْ، التَّمِسُوهَا فِي السَّبْعِ وَالتِّسْعِ وَالخُمْسِ» Prophet (saw) said, "I came out to inform you about (the date of) the night of Al-Qadr, but as so and so and so quarrelled, its knowledge was taken away (I forgot it) and maybe it was better for you. Now look for it in the 7th, the 9th and the 5th (of the last 10 nights of the month of Ramadan)."

The following is stated in the explanation of the Hadith by Ibn Hajar in Fath Al-Bari:

[His saying that He (saw) came out to inform of Lailat ul-Qadr i.e., to inform the time of Lailat ul-Qadr, and His saying "talaha" with "fatha" on the "Ha" a source of "talahi" with "kasra" of "Ha" which is to quarrel and dispute. His saying (saw) "fa-rufi'at" i.e., "its knowledge was taken away (I forgot it)", this is what is taken here, because of what Muslim explained in the Hadith of Abi Sa'id about this story. He said two men were "yahtaqinan" with shada on the "Qaf" i.e., both claiming that they are right, with them is the Shaytan, so I forgot it. Al-Qadi Ayad said in this an indication that fighting is dispraised and it is the reason for moral punishment, i.e., deprivation, that the place (of the fight) in which the Shaytan is present, the Baraka and good is taken from it.] End

By carefully examining the Hadith, it becomes clear that the Prophet (saw) did not know when Lailat ul-Qadr would be in Ramadan, so he (saw) performed l'tikaaf in the middle ten days of Ramadan seeking Lailat ul-Qadr, then he ordered the building that he had built to do i'tikaaf in it to be demolished. Then he (saw) was shown the night in which Lailat ul-Qadr is in the last ten days of Ramadan. When he (saw) wanted to inform the Muslims of its time, two men from the Muslims were diputing, so the Prophet (saw) was made to forget the night. So he (saw) ordered the people to seek it in the last ten days. The Prophet (saw) explained that the reason that made him forget is the dispute between the two men. In this is an explanation of the dangers of disputes and differences in Islam, as is shown in the explanation of the Hadith above.

Also, there is wisdom in the matter that suits the last ten days of Ramadan when there is a lack of determination, so not specifying Lailat ul-Qadr and making it in one of the nights of the last ten days pushes people to strive in the last ten days, to obtain the general good by that. Al-Nasafi aptly said in his tafser: (Perhaps the reason for concealing it is that whoever is seeking it is to revive it in the many nights in hope of attaining it. This is like concealing the middle prayer, His (swt) Greatest Name, and the Hour of Answer (of duaa) on Friday).

So, where is the problem in this Hadith, for the author of the article to reject it? And why is it not correct for the Messenger (saw) to forget what is shown to him, if that is due to a wisdom that is required?! It is clear that the author of the transmitted text neglected this reason and this wisdom to continue his objection and rejection of the Hadiths of Lailat ul-Qadr.

Thus, every Hadith is not rejected out of desire, ignorance, or hatred against Islam and Muslims. Rather, it is studied by its people and must be studied correctly, and then should be inquired about, if it is not known, as stated in the previous Hadith of the Messenger of Allah (saw): «أَلَا سَنَأُلُوا إِذْ لَمْ يَعْلَمُوا فَإِتَّمَا شِفَاءُ الْعِيَ السُوَالُ» "Could they not ask when they did not know? The cure for ignorance is inquiry."

Fourth: With all of this, it becomes clear that the author of the quoted text has no share of the knowledge of the transmitted (evidences), nor does he have share of the rational (evidences), and he has knowledge of jurisprudence or the science of Hadith or in the Usul (fundamentals). He does not weigh matters with a correct scale, nor does he establish the matter on a straight path, rather it appears from his opinion that he is trying to destroy the Deen and its edifice, and casts doubt in Muslims of the origin and branches of the Deen. Had it not been for the questioner inquiry about his opinion, we would not have preoccupied ourselves with responding to his delusions. In conclusion, we ask Allah (swt) to repel the plot of the plotters against them, and to protect the Ummah from their evils, and to raise the status of the Deen and support its servants, the believers and extinguishes the fire of the kuffar, the hypocrites, and those who want to cast doubts.

Your Brother,
Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah
8 Ramadan 1444 AH
30/3/2023 CE

The link to the answer from the Ameer's Facebook page:

https://www.facebook.com/HT.AtaabuAlrashtah/posts/774592814228090