

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

Series of Questions Addressed to Eminent Scholar Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah,
Ameer of Hizb ut Tahrir through his Facebook Fiqhi Page

Answer to Question

Does The Reward of the Charity Given by the Righteous Son On Behalf of the Deceased Father Count for the Deceased?

To Ameer Turman

(Translated)

Question:

Assalamu Alaikum Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh

Greetings to you, our sheikh and our Ameer, from our hearts.

The Prophet (saw) said: **إذا مات ابن آدم انقطع عمله إلا من ثلاث، صدقة جارية، علم ينتفع به، أو ولد صالح** The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: **“When a man dies, his deeds come to an end except for three: Sadaqah Jariyah (ceaseless charity); a knowledge which is beneficial, or a virtuous descendant who prays for him (for the deceased).”**

Is it required that the Sadaqah Jariyah (ceaseless charity) be the one that the deceased gave before his death, or is the one given by his sons on his behalf is counted for him?

May Allah (swt) guide your steps to the truth and take lead you to that which has the honour of the Ummah.

Answer:

Wa Alaikum Assalam Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh

The Hadith is about the deeds of the dead (his deeds come to an end except for three), Sadaqah Jariyah (ceaseless charity); a knowledge which is beneficial, or a virtuous descendant who prays for him (for the deceased).

As for the deceased being rewarded for the deed of others for him: there are deeds on his behalf from others that are rewarded are counted for him, including charity on his behalf by his children, which they gave with the intention that its reward will be counted for him.

1- Al-Shawkani said in Nayl Al-Awtar:

[1488- on the authority of Abu Huraira (ra) that a man said to the Prophet (saw): **إِنَّ أَبِي مَاتَ وَلَمْ يُوَصِّ، وَلَمْ يُوصِ، أَفِيَنْفَعُهُ أَنْ أَتَصَدَّقَ عَنْهُ؟ قَالَ: «نَعَمْ»** **“My father died and left behind wealth, but he did not leave a will. Will it expiate for him if I give charity on his behalf?”** (Narrated by Ahmad, Muslim, Nasa’i and Ibn Majah)

[1489- A’isha said that a man told the Prophet (saw): **إِنَّ أُمَّيْ أُمَّيْ أُمَّيْ نَفْسُهَا، وَأَرَاهَا لَوْ تَكَلَّمْتُ تَصَدَّقْتُ، فَهَلْ لَهَا أَجْرٌ إِنْ تَصَدَّقْتُ عَنْهَا؟ قَالَ نَعَمْ** His mother had died suddenly adding that he thought she would have given *sadaqa* if she had been able to speak. He therefore asked if she would have a reward supposing he gave *sadaqa* on her behalf, and was told that she would. (Agreed upon).

[1491- **On authority of Al-Hassan “from Sa’d bin ‘Ubadah that his mother died. He said:** **«عَنْ سَعْدِ بْنِ عُبَادَةَ أَنَّ أُمَّهُ مَاتَتْ فَقَالَ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، إِنَّ أُمَّيْ مَاتَتْ أَفَأَتَصَدَّقُ عَنْهَا؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ قُلْتُ: فَأَيُّ الصَّدَقَةِ أَفْضَلُ؟ قَالَ: «O Messenger of Allah, my mother has died; can I give**

charity on her behalf?" He said: "Yes." He said: "What kind of charity is best?" He said: "Providing drinking water." And that is the drinking-fountain of Sa'd in Al-Madinah." (Narrated by Ahmad and Nasa'i).

“Chapter on the reward of the deeds given to the dead reaching them”

His saying: “it benefits him” is an evidence that what the son did to his Muslim father of fasting and charity is counted for the father. He said: “*Uftulita*” with the *dham* (noun gerund of verb to append) of the letter *-ta* after the letter *-fa* followed by *-lam maksoora* in the anonymous format means she suddenly died, in the dictionary. His saying: “*Nafsu*” by *dham* of the *-seen* is *na'ib fa'il* (subject of the passive). His saying ‘*Araha*’ with the *dham* of Hamza means I think...His saying: “*Suqqi Al-Ma*’ (Providing drinking water)” is an evidence that providing drinking water is the best charity.

The version of Abu Dawud: "فَأَيُّ الصَّدَقَةِ أَفْضَلُ؟ قَالَ: الْمَاءُ، فَحَفَرَ بِنْرًا وَقَالَ: هَذِهِ لِأُمِّ سَعْدٍ" Which Sadaqa is best? He said: Water. So, he dug a well and said: this is for Saad's mother." This Hadith was extracted by Ad-Darqutniin “Ghara'ib Malik”, and Al-Muwata’ extracted from the Hadith of Sa’eed bin ‘Amir bin Sa’d bin ‘Ubadah that: «حَرَجَ سَعْدٌ مَعَ النَّبِيِّ ﷺ فِي بَعْضِ مَعَارِيزِهِ وَحَضَرَتْ أُمُّهُ الْوَفَاءُ. فَقَالَ لَهَا: أَوْصِي، فَقَالَتْ: فِيْمَ أَوْصِي وَالْمَالُ مَالُ سَعْدٍ؟ فَتَوَقَّيْتُ قَبْلَ أَنْ يُقَدَّمَ سَعْدٌ» "Sa'd bin 'Ubadah went out with the Prophet (saw) on one of his campaigns, and death came to his mother in Al-Madinah. It was said to her (as she was dying): 'Make a will.' She said: 'To whom shall I make a will? The wealth belongs to Sa'd.' Then she died before Sa'd came”.

The Hadith mentioned, and it is said: the unknown man in the Hadith of A'isah and in the Hadith of Ibn Abbas is Sa'd bin Ubada. This indicates that Al-Bukhari narrated after the Hadith of A'isha the Hadith of Ibn Abbas with this version: «إِنَّ سَعْدَ بْنَ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ قَالَ: إِنَّ أُمَّيَ مَاتَتْ وَعَلَيْهَا نَذْرٌ...» "...that Sa'd bin Ubada said: 'My mother died and there was an (outstanding) vow that she had to fulfil.”

As if it is a reference in the Hadith of A'isha that it is Sa'd and the Hadiths of Albab indicates that the charity from the son, its reward reaches the parents, i.e., the parents will be rewarded for the actions after they die without a will they make, and their reward reaches them, so these Hadiths make the general verse specified, Allah (swt) says: ﴿وَأَنْ لَيْسَ لِلْإِنْسَانِ إِلَّا مَا سَعَى﴾ **“And that there is not for man except that [good] for which he strives”** [An-Najm: 39].

However, the Hadiths of Albab are concerned only with the charity of the son's reward being counted for the parent, it is confirmed that the son is part of the strive of the person so there is no need for specification...]

2- Sharh An-Nawawi on Muslim (3/444)

[1672- On the authority of Muhammad bin Abdullah bin Numair, from Muhammad bin Bishr, from Hisham from his father from ‘Aisha that

A man came to the Prophet (saw) and said, “ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، إِنَّ أُمَّيَ افْتَأْتَنَتْ نَفْسَهَا وَلَمْ تُوصِ وَأَطْنُهَا لَوْ تَكَلَّمْتُ ” "O Allah's Messenger, my mother had died suddenly, and did not make a will. And I think she would have given out Sadaqah if she had been able to speak, so will she get a reward if I gave out Sadaqah on her behalf?" He replied, "Yes."

Zuhair bin Harb reported that Yahya bin Sa’eed, that Abu Kuraib reported that Abu Usama reported that Ali bin Hujr reported that Ali bin Mushir reported, Al-Hakam bin Musa reported, Shu’aib bin Ishaq reported, all from Hisham with this chain of transmitters (Isnad) and in the Hadith of Abu Usama, that she did not leave a will as bin Bishr said, and the rest did not narrate this.

1672- His saying: ““my mother had died suddenly”, يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ إِنَّ أُمَّيْ إِفْتَلَّتْ نَفْسَهَا

It is corrected: the word; نَفْسَهَا and نَفْسَهَا is with the *nasb* of the letter -seen and its *raf*. When it is in the *raf* format it is *maf'ool* if its subject is not named. / the case of *nasb* it is a second *maf'ool* (object). The judge said: most of our narrations are in the *nasb* format. And his saying: فَتَلَّتْ With -fa is what Ahl Al-Hadith and others narrated. Ibn Qutaiyba narrated: إِفْتَلَّتْ نَفْسَهَا with -qaf, and said: it is a word used to indicate the one who died suddenly. It is also used for the one killed by madness and love.

Using -Fa is correct. They said: it means that she died suddenly, and everything that is done suddenly is said it is: 'Uftulitat' أُفْتُلِتْ It is said: a person said words 'Uftulitat' أُفْتُلِتْ and suggested and made it brief if it was improvised.

What it means is that it died suddenly, everything that was done without stopping, and it was torn apart.

And the saying: أَفَلَهَا أَجْرٌ إِنْ تَصَدَّقْتَ عَنْهَا؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ will she be rewarded if I give charity on her behalf, he (saw) said yes.

His saying: if I give charity تَصَدَّقْتَ is with *kasr* of the *hamza in* (إِنْ) and there is no difference in this. The judge said: this is the narration regarding it. He said: other than this opinion is not correct, because he asked about an action that he did not perform yet.

In this Hadith: the charity on behalf of the dead benefits him and its reward will reach him this is a unanimous agreement of scholars, they also agreed on the Duaa (supplication) and paying the due debt, according to the all texts mentioned. Hajj is on behalf of the dead is valid, if it is Hajj in Islam, and this is similar if the deceased left a will to perform the voluntary Hajj, in our opinion. Scholars differed if the deceased died while having fasting days to make up, the stronger opinion is that it is allowed to fast them on his behalf, according to the sahih Hadith on the subject. What is known in our opinion is that the reward of reciting the Qur'an does not reach him. A group from our companions, the scholars, said the reward reaches him, it is the saying of Ahmad bin Hanbal. As for prayer and all other acts of worship, they do not reach him (i.e. he is rewarded for it) according to and according to the group, and Ahmad said: He (the deceased) will be rewarded rewards of all the worships (on his behalf) like Hajj.]

Thus, giving charity on behalf of your father and your intention is to do for him, he will be rewarded for it, Allah willing, and Allah Knows Best, He is Most Wise.

Your Brother,

Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah

9 Ramadan 1443 AH

10/4/2022 CE

The link to the answer from the Ameer's Facebook page:

<https://web.facebook.com/HT.AtaabuAlrashtah/posts/529416622079045>